High temperature behavior of electrostatic precipitator ash from municipal solid waste combustors
Lydie Le Forestier, Guy Libourel

To cite this version:

HAL Id: insu-00170615
https://hal-insu.archives-ouvertes.fr/insu-00170615v2
Submitted on 22 Oct 2007

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.
High temperature behavior of electrostatic precipitator ash from municipal solid waste combustors

Lydie Le Forestier a,*, Guy Libourel b,c

a ISTO, UMR 6113 CNRS-Université d’Orléans, Polytech’Orléans, 8 rue Léonard de Vinci, 45072 Orléans Cedex 2, France
b CRPG-CNRS, UPR 2300, BP 20, 54501 Vandœuvre-lès-Nancy, France
c ENSG-INPL, BP 40, 54501 Vandœuvre-lès-Nancy, France

* Corresponding author
E-mail address: lydie.leforestier@univ-orleans.fr
Tel.: +33 238255393; fax: +33 238636488

Journal of Hazardous Materials
Ms. Ref. No.: HAZMAT-D-07-00176

Accepted manuscript
Abstract
Municipal solid waste (MSW) flue gas residues require further treatment prior to disposal or reuse, and vitrification is one of the main solidification-stabilization processes. This paper investigates the high temperature behavior of MSW flue gas residues, performed in laboratory experiments up to 1400°C, and coupled with thermogravimetric analyses, X-ray diffraction, chemical and electron microprobe analyses. Melting temperatures of electrostatic precipitator (ESP) ash are in the range of 1202-1272 °C, whereas semi-dry scrubber residues melt between 1900 and 2300 °C. We show that the mean liquidus temperature of flue gas residues can be simply evaluated from their CaO content, by using the CaO-SiO₂-Al₂O₃ ternary diagram. For ESP ash, the liquidus phase is a Zn-rich aluminous spinel, followed by anorthite at 1225 °C, and melilite at 1190 °C. The total mass loss reaches 18 wt.% at 1300 °C. Moreover, 90% of evaporation takes place below 1000 °C, linked to evaporation of C, Cl, S, Na, K, and of the toxic metals Hg, Cd, Pb, Cu. Due to the high partial pressure of chlorine during heating, chloride is the most probable form of evaporation for Cd, Pb, and Cu. However, most of Zn, Cr, Ni, Sb and Sn remain in the vitrified product.

Keywords: Fly ash; Vitrification; Melting temperature; Evaporation; Toxic metals
1. Introduction

Incineration is an efficient method for managing municipal solid wastes (MSW), achieving up to a 90% volume reduction, a 60 to 75% mass reduction, a destruction of pathogenic agents and a possible recovery of energy. Whatever MSW combustor used, combustion of MSW produces two kinds of solid residues: (i) bottom ashes recovered from the primary combustor, and (ii) residues recovered from the treatment of flue gas. Due to their high contents of pollutant elements [1-6], many studies have been devoted to the characterization of flue gas residues, and particularly of electrostatic precipitator (ESP) ashes. Since solid flue gas residues are subject to leaching during their storage [5,7-13], they are potentially toxic for the environment and thus require further treatment before their long-term disposal. The aim of this waste management is that the ash-like toxic material could be transformed into a durable solid with a minimal release of pollutants into the environment. The solidification-stabilization processes include (1) extraction using acid or other solvents, (2) cement-based processes and (3) vitrification (melting and solidification). The vitrification technology mainly consists in melting these hazardous ashes at approximately 1400 °C in a high-temperature furnace and cooling in order to solidify them again. Even if energetic costs are important, vitrification, by comparison with hydraulic binders, (1) reduces the volume of residue, (2) leads to complete destruction of toxic organic compounds, and (3) produces a relatively inert residue, constituted by glass and/or crystals, and known as slag. During the melting operation, the non-volatile metals are immobilized into the structure of the slag, whereas the volatile metals are mainly transferred by evaporation to the exhaust gas, and converted into gas cooler ash. According to the French legislation, the melted slags resulting from flue gas residues, previously considered as hazardous wastes, are now stored in disposals dedicated for inert wastes. Studies devoted to the long-term behavior of these slags are still in progress, and the use of melted slags as secondary raw materials like bottom ashes will depend on the obtained results. The kinetics of evaporation of Cd, Pb, Cu, Zn from a MSW fly ash were
determinated in different atmospheres between 670 and 1300 °C [14,15]. Moreover, Sakai and Hiraoka [16] have investigated the distribution of metals between melted slag, gas cooler ash and bag filter ash obtained after direct melting of fly ashes at 1400 °C. Finally, leaching characteristics of melted slag have been documented by Lin and Chang [17]. However, only few data are available concerning element behavior of MSW flue gas residues coupled with their mineralogy during thermal treatment. In this study, thanks to high-temperature experiments performed with MSW flue gas residues, we evaluate the range of their melting temperatures and their high-temperature phase relationships, together with the elemental behaviour between 150 and 1400 °C, especially for pollutant metals.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Experimental design

This study principally focused on electrostatic precipitator (ESP) ash resulting from direct electrofiltration of flue gas. These solid residues were sampled in a MSW combustion facility located in an urban area of 600 000 inhabitants in the southeast France, equipped with two parallel trains of 12 ton/h each. MSW is fed into the combustion chamber with a grate consisting of six rollers for each train. The ESP ashes were compared to another type of flue gas residues, a semi-dry scrubber residue (SDSR), obtained by semi-dry process, in which flue gas, after cooling, is cleaned by injection of a lime slurry into the scrubber. These SDSR residues come from a MSW combustion facility located in northeast France, equipped with two parallel trains, each having a nominal capacity rating of 6 ton/h, and a primary combustor with movable grates. The feed stream is composed of household waste collected from an area with 167 000 inhabitants. ESP ashes and SDSR correspond to aluminosilicate materials, rich in calcium and chlorine, and containing numerous pollutants (As, Cd, Cr, Hg, Ni, Pb, Zn...) from tens of μg/g to tens of thousands of μg/g. These
residues consist of a very heterogeneous assemblage of glasses, metals, and crystals in which pollutant elements are distributed [5].

In order to determine the factors that control the behavior of pollutant elements in MSW combustors, and during the vitrification process, several types of experiments were performed using ESP ashes. We first defined their mean liquidus temperature and their liquidus phases (Table 1). In addition, during the heating of these residues, total mass loss was monitored by thermogravimetric experiments, changes in the mineralogy by X-ray diffraction and elemental behavior by chemical analyses. Finally, a set of experiments was carried out above the liquidus temperature, in order to document the evaporation rate of the main pollutants during vitrification of these ESP ashes.

2.2. Raw material and sample preparation

The chemistry and the mineralogy of several ESP ashes, sampled during two distinct periods in one combustion facility located in southeast France have been documented in a previous paper [5]. Since one of the main results of this study was to demonstrate the low seasonal chemical and mineralogical variations, one representative ESP ash of this sampling, noted ESP 261, have been chosen (Table 2). Two to three kilos of this sample were collected directly at the base of the electrostatic filter, prior to the storage silo. Then 50 grams were taken and quarted, in order to ensure sample homogeneity, and finally ground to a grain size less than 70 µm. The same protocole was used to sample one representative SDSR in a facility located in northeast France, where flue gas are treated by a semi-dry process.

2.3. Experimental methods

All experiments were performed at atmospheric pressure in a Gero vertical drop-quench furnace, which can reach 1700 °C. Temperature was controlled using a Eurotherm
818 controller and measured by two independent Pt-PtRh10 thermocouples located in the hotspot of the furnace.

For the determination of the melting temperature, aliquots of 50-100 mg of powdery starting material were pressed onto wire platinum loops, with a diameter of 0.10 mm, using polyvinyl alcohol as a binder. The sample was introduced into the center of the tube furnace, and directly heated at the dwell temperature. After each experiment and in order to frozen in the high temperature phase relations, the sample was drop-quenched in water at a quenching rates of the order of 500°C.s⁻¹. It was then mounted as polished sections for optical determination and/or electron-microprobe analyses.

The thermogravimetric analysis (TGA) measurements were carried out on a Sartorius LP220S, with a precision of 1 mg. For each TGA run, a platinum crucible filled with 2 grams of sample was heated with a constant heating rate of 25 °C per hour from 100 °C to the final chosen temperature (150 °C, 400 °C, 650 °C, 1000 °C, and 1300 °C), and held at this final temperature during one hour. At the end of TGA runs, samples were promptly removed from the furnace and stored in an oven to avoid any hydration from the ambient atmosphere. ICP-AES, ICP-MS and wet chemical methods were undertaken on these samples for bulk chemistry, while X-ray diffraction was used for mineralogical characterization.

For direct melting experiments, a platinum crucible was filled with 2 grams of sample, introduced into the center of the tube furnace, and directly heated from ambient (25 °C) to the dwell temperature (1400 °C), during 1 hour and 16 hours respectively. At the end of each experiment, the sample was drop-quenched in water, and analyzed in the same way as TGA samples.

2.4. Analytical methods

For the determination of melting temperature and crystallization sequence, polished thin sections of quenched samples were examined using a CAMECA SX-50 electron
microprobe equipped with 4 spectrometers and a wavelength-dispersive system (WDS), at the Université Henri Poincaré, Nancy 1. All WDS analyses were performed with a 15 kV accelerating voltage and 10.0 nA beam current. The following elements were analyzed: Na, Mg, Al, Si, P, S, Cl, K, Ca, Ti, Cr, Fe, Zn, and Pb. Electron microprobe standardization was conducted using polished geological standards prior to analyses. Incident-beam diameter was 10 µm on glass to minimize the volatilization of alkalis, whereas a focused beam was used on crystalline phases.

For bulk chemistry performed at the Service d’Analyse des Roches et des Minéraux (SARM, CRPG-CNRS), major elements (Si, Al, Fe, Mn, Mg, Ca, Na, K, Ti and P) were analyzed by inductively coupled plasma atomic emission spectroscopy (ICP-AES), chlorine by absorptiometry, fluorine by potentiometry, sulfur and carbon by impulsion coulometry. Concentrations of trace pollutant elements (As to Zn) were measured by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (ICP-MS), except for mercury, analyzed by atomic absorption. Details of these chemical methods are given in a previous paper [5]. The relative uncertainties are 5 to 25 % for contents around 1 µg/g, 2 to 10 % for contents in the order of 10 µg/g, and 2 to 5 % above 100 µg/g.

For X-ray diffraction, a Jobin Yvon-Sigma 2080 diffractometer was used along with a copper X-ray source (38 kV, 20 mA, 800 W) on sample powder (< 50 µm). Scans were conducted from 2 to 32° at a rate of 0.5° of θ per minute. The diffractogram was evaluated for possible crystalline phases using the ASTM (American Society for Testing Materials) data base for pure species.

3. Results

3.1. Melting temperature and phase relations

The liquidus temperature of ESP ashes was determined either by the reading of appropriate phase diagram and by melting experiments performed in high temperature
furnace. Since ESP ashes are mainly constituted by SiO₂, CaO, Al₂O₃ and Cl, with a total of around 75 wt.%, [3,5], and that chlorine is a highly volatile element, the melting products of fusion of ESP ashes can be properly represented in the ternary diagram CaO-SiO₂-Al₂O₃ [18]. All ESP ash compositions documented by Le Forestier and Libourel [5] were plotted in this diagram. These residues cluster in the same area, close to the gehlenite-anorthite cotectic curve, which confirms their homogeneous composition in term of major elements (Fig. 1). The direct reading of this phase diagram allows us to estimate the melting temperatures of ESP ashes in the range 1265 °C-1400 °C.

These ESP ashes were compared to another type of flue gas residues, a semi-dry scrubber residue (SDSR), obtained by semi-dry process, in which flue gas, after cooling, is cleaned by injection of a lime slurry into the scrubber. In the same diagram (Fig. 1), SDSR samples are scattered toward the CaO end-member, in response to lime injection in the scrubber to neutralize acid gases. Accordingly, their melting temperature varies between 1900 °C and 2300 °C, revealing the more refractory character of SDSR. Moreover, Fig. 1 shows that, despite the chemical and mineralogical discrepancies between SDSR and ESP ashes, their SiO₂/Al₂O₃ ratio hardly varies outside 1.5 and 2.7. Assuming that these variations correspond to most of the flue gas residues, a temperature-composition section (T-X) can be drawn from this phase diagram to evaluate their liquidus temperature, simply as a function of their CaO content (Fig. 2).

In order to better constrain the melting temperatures of ESP ashes, a set of heating experiments was carried out on two different samples, for which experimental conditions are reported in Table 1. Experiments show that the liquidus temperature of ESP 261 and ESP 110 are in the range 1256-1272 °C and 1202-1256 °C, respectively.

In addition, these experiments allow to characterize the phase relationships below the liquidus temperature. For ESP 261, electron microprobe analyses reveal that the liquidus phase is a spinel, belonging to the solid solution between spinel stricto sensu and Zn-rich aluminous spinel related to franklinite, containing an average of 7.24 ± 0.39 wt.%
of Zn, 2.34 ± 0.29 wt.% of Fe, and 0.88 ± 0.47 wt.% of Cr. At 1225 °C, anorthite (CaAl2Si2O8) joins spinel as a crystallizing phase, followed by melilite (Ca2Mg0.26Al1.38Si1.53O7) at 1190 °C. Similar phase relationships were obtained for ESP 110.

3.2. Mass losses

Since solidification-stabilization processes may involve high temperature treatments, both chemical and mineralogical changes due to heating of ESP ash were investigated, using the coupling of thermogravimetric experiments, X-ray diffraction and chemical analyses.

Several thermogravimetric analyses (TGA) were performed on the representative ESP 261 sample between 100 °C and 1300 °C (Fig. 3), in order to characterize the associated mineralogical and chemical changes. The resulting thermogravimetric curves for final temperatures of 1300 °C, 1000 °C and 650 °C have the same shape, which confirms the reproductivity of mass loss, and indicate a total mass loss of around 18 wt.% at the final temperature of 1300 °C. In details, the TGA curves show an initial rapid decrease between 100 and 150 °C, followed by a less important mass loss in the range of 150 to 550 °C. After a step with no mass loss between 550 and 800 °C, we observe a significant decrease up to 1000 °C. Above this temperature, the mass loss remains weak up to the melting temperature, suggesting that around 90 % of the mass loss takes place before 1000 °C for this ESP ash.

X-ray diffractograms were carried out on the representative ESP 261 sample and on the by-products of each TGA experiments performed at 150 °C, 400 °C, 650 °C, 1000 °C, and 1300 °C, in order to relate these mass losses to mineralogical changes (Fig. 4). X-ray diffraction pattern reveals the occurrence of halite, sylvite, quartz, melilite, calcite, anhydrite, feldspar, and hematite in the selected ESP ash. However, our previous study devoted to the detailed characterization of MSW flue gas residues [5] has highlighted the
more complex mineralogy of ESP ashes with the occurrence of other silicates, carbonates, chlorides, sulphates, oxides, and also graphite, hydroxides (e.g. portlandite), phosphates, and metallic phases (e.g. Al, Zn). As shown by X-ray diffraction, TGA products obtained at 150 °C and 400 °C contain the same major phases as the initial ESP ash (Fig. 4). At 650 °C, corresponding to a relative mass loss of 11 wt.%, the mineralogy is clearly different, with the disappearance of chlorides (sylvite and halite) and calcite, and the crystallization of mayenite (Ca\textsubscript{12}Al\textsubscript{14}O\textsubscript{33}). At 1000 °C, mayenite and anhydrite no longer exist, whereas the intensity of peaks for melilite and wollastonite (CaSiO\textsubscript{3}) increases. Finally, all peaks of diffraction disappear in favour of amorphous bump at 1300 °C, which confirms the melting of ESP ashes in this temperature range (Fig. 1 and 2).

In addition, after TGA, all samples were analyzed by ICP-AES and ICP-MS, analytical results are reported in Table 2. By comparison with non-heated samples, these results reveal that, as expected, refractory elements concentrate in the most heated samples, while the reverse trend is observed for the volatile elements. For instance, Al, Ca and Ti contents increase with temperature, whereas Cl, S, Na, and K contents decline. Amongst the pollutant elements, Hg, Cd, Pb, and Cu are strongly depleted, whereas As, Co, Cr, Ni, Sb, Sn, and Zn remain in the residues.

Since the glass resulting from TGA experiment at 1300 °C was obtained after 48 hours of heating, additional melting experiments were performed on the same starting ESP composition, in order to better simulate the vitrification occurring at an industrial scale. Experiments were carried out for 1 and 16 hours by direct melting of the sample at 1400 °C in air (Table 2). All experiments produced calcium-rich aluminosilicate glasses. Both calculated and measured mass losses are in good agreement, 19 wt.% for melting during TGA experiment at 1300 °C, and ~22 wt.% for direct melting at 1400 °C for 1 and 16 hours. These results show that, by comparison with the initial composition, the main changes of composition occur during the first hour, in accordance with the work of Jakob et al. [14] on similar flue gas residues.
4. Discussion

4.1. High temperature behavior of ESP ash

The relative amount of evaporation of elements can be calculated from the mass loss and the chemical composition, using the following expression:

\[ E_{i,T} = 100 \cdot \left[ 1 - \left( \frac{m_T}{m_0} \right) \cdot \left( \frac{X_{i,T}}{X_{i,0}} \right) \right] \]

where \( E_{i,T} \) is the relative amount of evaporation of the element \( i \) at temperature \( T \), \( m_T \) is the final mass measured at \( T \), \( m_0 \) is the initial mass (2 grams), \( X_{i,T} \) is the content of \( i \) in the product obtained after TGA up to \( T \), and \( X_{i,0} \) is the content of \( i \) in the initial ESP ash. Chemical analyses of the initial ESP ash and of each TGA product are given in Table 2, whereas relative amount of evaporation for major volatile elements as a function of temperature is represented in Fig. 5.

All together, these results allow to depict the high temperature behavior of these ESP ashes, in term of their mineralogy and chemistry. After the evaporation of 2.1 wt.% water before 150 °C, organic carbon has been oxidized to CO\(_2\) and almost totally volatilized at 400 °C. The remaining carbon, given by difference between total carbon and organic carbon, is related to carbonates. According to Fig. 5a, this inorganic carbon is volatilized at 650 °C, due to the disappearance of calcite by decarbonatation, as shown by X-ray diffractograms in Fig. 4. Similarly, the disappearance of chlorides (halite and sylvite) around 650 °C is supported by the similar behavior of alkali elements (Na and K) and chlorine, with a significant increase of their evaporation rate between 400 and 1000 °C. In the same temperature range, a calcium aluminate, i.e. mayenite (Ca\(_{12}\)Al\(_{14}\)O\(_{33}\)) formed (Fig. 4), very likely in response to the dehydration of portlandite or the decalcification of CaO-SiO\(_2\)-H\(_2\)O (CSH) phases and the oxidation of metallic aluminum. At 1000 °C, the mineralogy is dominated by melilite, quartz, feldspar and wollastonite. Raising the temperature up to 1000°C led to the development of wollastonite and melilite. This is in agreement with the
findings of Karoly et al. [19] who conducted heat treatment of MSW fly ashes at temperatures between 850 and 1050°C, however, using a previous melting at 1600°C followed by a cooling and annealing at 600°C. As shown in Fig. 5a, sulfur shows a contrasting behavior, by comparison with chlorine, and mainly vaporizes between 1000 and 1300 °C. After direct melting at 1190 °C of ESP ash, the main crystalline phases were identified as spinel, anorthite, and melilite. These parageneses, obtained at 1000 °C and 1190 °C, are in agreement with phase relationships at the eutectic point (1170 °C) in the ternary diagram CaO-SiO2-Al2O3 (Fig. 1). Clozel and Legendre [20] have characterized the paragenesis of MSW flue gas residues heated at around 1200 °C. They have identified similar phases (spinel stricto sensu, melilite close to gehlenite, plagioclase), but also Ca rich-pyroxene and some minor phases such as apatite and perovskite. Moreover, our melting temperatures are in good agreement with Lin and Chang [17] for the melting of a cyclone ash (1250 °C), and a little above to those given by Jakob et al. [14] for MSWC fly ashes (1180 °C), because of higher amounts of refractory elements (Ca, Al, Mg) in our selected ESP ash.

The predicted liquidus temperatures, obtained by using the ternary diagram CaO-SiO2-Al2O3, are in the same order of magnitude as the experimental ones, but a little higher. The small difference may be simply explained by the presence of minor elements which act as fluxes (e.g. Fe, Na, K, P). Therefore, predicted liquidus temperature based on the CaO-SiO2-Al2O3 ternary diagram represents an upper limit for the melting of ESP ashes.

4.2. Specific behavior of pollutants

Concerning pollutant elements (Fig. 5b), all mercury has already volatilized at 400 °C. Metallic mercury Hg⁰ has very low boiling point, at 357 °C [21], and according to Galbreath and Zygarlicke [22], Hg⁰(g) is the thermodynamically stable form in the highest temperature regions of combustors. However, the high chlorine partial pressure prevailing during waste combustion may cause the oxidation of mercury, and chloride mercury...
species may be the major form in the cooling process of flue gas, as shown by Ghorishi et al. [23], Chen et al. [24]. Lead, cadmium and copper show similar evaporation curves, with the principal volatilization between 650 and 1000 °C. For fine-grained fly ash, Jakob et al. [14] have found that more than 90 % of evaporation in air is obtained from 670 °C for Pb, 750 °C for Cd, and 850 °C for Cu. Considering the boiling points of Pb, Cd and Cu and their compounds (e.g. oxides, chlorides, sulphates) [21], we can deduce that (i) none of the oxides is volatile below 1000 °C, (ii) Pb and Cu metals are refractory, whereas Cd metal is volatile at 765 °C, (iii) sulphates of Cd and Pb are not volatile, and CuSO₄ is decomposed in CuO, (iv) chlorides of Pb, Cd and Cu are volatile below 1000 °C. As the high chlorine content in ESP ash will create an important partial pressure of chlorine during heating, chloride is the most probable form of evaporation for Pb, Cd and Cu. Fig. 5b shows a lesser evaporation for copper at high temperature, which can be explained by the occurrence of metallic alloys in addition with chloride copper.

For zinc, the relative amount of evaporation raises with increasing temperature from 0 % at 650 °C, 20 % at 1000 °C, and 1300 °C (Fig. 5b). The direct melting at 1400 °C during one hour reveals an evaporation of zinc at around 60 % (Table 2). Incomplete evaporation is found for zinc in air. That is in accordance with the crystallization of spinel, the stable phase at the liquidus, which contains more than 7 % of zinc. Jakob et al. [14] found also an increasing evaporation of zinc, up to 51 % at 1030 °C, but followed by a decrease to as low as 14 % at temperatures above the melting range of the filter ash. According to these authors, zinc exists in the form of oxide in the initial filter ash, and heating in air creates a competition between the formation of volatile zinc chloride and the formation of stable zinc silicate and zinc spinel. Struis et al. [25] have detailed the quantitative Zn speciation at different heat treatment stages, under Ar or Ar+O₂ carrier gas. Under O₂-enriched carrier gas, the Zn-bearing species of fly ash samples collected at different temperatures (400 °C, 765 °C and 910 °C) were identified as Zn₂SiO₄, ZnAl₂O₄, Zn₅(OH)₅(CO₃)₂, and ZnO. We suggest a complex crystal-chemistry of zinc in the initial
ESP ash, as shown by a previous study [5]: zinc was found as pure metallic particles, spinels, alloys, and Ca-bearing aluminosilicate glasses. It is noticeable that particles of zinc metal and alloys can have been partially oxidized during heating in air. So, the increase of evaporation of zinc is due to the different Zn-bearing species, which are very volatile (e.g. zinc metal) as well as refractory (e.g. spinel).

The other potentially toxic metals reveal a different behavior during heating, even if uncertainties of the calculated amounts of evaporation are higher due to the low contents of these metals in the fly ash residues. Chromium presents a negligible evaporation (Fig. 5b), and a similar trend was obtained for nickel, antimony and tin. No evidence was found concerning their main bearing phases, with the notable exception of Ni, for which spinel and metallic alloys were identified as potential Ni carrier.

5. Conclusions

The results presented in this study can be thus used as a guide for vitrification processes, especially for industrial furnace control. So, in industrial glassmaking furnaces using typically temperatures around 1400 °C, the direct vitrification of ESP ash is possible without any additives, because the silica content is enough to form a glass. On the contrary, semi-dry scrubber residues are more refractory with high amounts of calcium, and additives, such as Na₂CO₃ or SiO₂, are necessary to melt these residues at lower temperatures than their melting one [26].

In addition to previous studies, our knowledge of polluting element behavior of MSW flue gas residues at high temperature has been significantly improved, leading to two different strategies for the management of MSW flue gas residues. In the first one, the objective is to promote the efficiency of the transfer of pollutant elements to the raw gas, in order to obtain vitrified products containing low amounts of toxic elements. In this case, these vitrified products, often called slags, may be used as secondary raw materials, such as
subbase in road construction or supplement for pavement. However and as shown in this paper, fumes obtained after vitrification concentrated the more toxic and volatile elements, which may create hazardous aerosols during condensation. In order to avoid such a transfer of pollution from the solid by-product of the incineration to the gas, fumes have therefore to be treated before their release in the atmosphere. In this alternative strategy, the challenge is to remove the soluble metals (e.g. Hg, Cd, Pb) from the MSW flue gas residues by an efficient leaching before vitrification, and to retain in an irreversible manner most of the remaining polluting elements in the vitrified products, either in the glassy matrix or better in stable crystalline phases, like spinels for Cr, Ni, Zn. Since during storage or reuse of these vitrified products the risk of release of toxic metals in the environment remains a threat, it is clear that their long-term durability has to be investigated, as well.

Acknowledgements
Thanks are expressed to SARM (CRPG-CNRS, Nancy) for chemical analyses, François Lhôte (LEM, Nancy) for XRD, Sandrine Mathieu (Université Henri Poincaré, Nancy 1) for electron microprobe analyses. We also thank two anonymous reviewers for the constructive reviews that helped improve the clarity of the manuscript. This study was financially supported by the SITA group. Finally, the authors thank David Avery for English editing. This is a ISTO contribution n° YYYY and CRPG contribution n° XXXX.

References


Fig. 1. Liquidus surface, sub-solidus equilibria, and location of the electrostatic precipitator (ESP) ash and semi-wet scrubber residues (SDSR) samples in the CaO-SiO$_2$-Al$_2$O$_3$ system [18].

Fig. 2. Diagram showing the theoretical and experimental liquidus temperature of flue gas residues as a function of their CaO content, for two SiO$_2$/Al$_2$O$_3$ ratios, 1.5 and 2.7 respectively. This diagram corresponds to sections through the phase diagram in the CaO-SiO$_2$-Al$_2$O$_3$ system.

Fig. 3. Weight loss curves obtained by thermogravimetric analysis (TGA) of the selected electrostatic precipitator ash ESP 261. TGA 1300, TGA 1000 and TGA 650 correspond to thermogravimetric curves for final temperatures of 1300, 1000, and 650 °C, respectively. TGA, thermogravimetric analysis.

Fig. 4. X-ray diffraction patterns of the selected electrostatic precipitator ash ESP 261, and of run products obtained after thermogravimetric analysis (TGA) measurements. TGA 150, TGA 400, TGA 650, and TGA 1000 correspond to run products obtained after TGA for final temperatures of 150, 400, and 1000 °C, respectively. TGA, thermogravimetric analysis; Hl = halite; Syl = sylvite; Qtz = quartz; Cal = calcite; Anh = anhydrite; Mel = melilite; Fs = feldspar; Hem = hematite; May = mayenite; Wo = wollastonite. Symbols used for synthetic solid phases related to minerals are those of Kretz [27].

Fig. 5. Relative amount of evaporation as a function of temperature, (a) of the volatile elements Na, K, Rb, Cs, Cl, S, C, TOC (total organic carbon), and (b) of the pollutant elements Hg, Cd, Pb, Cu, Zn, Cr, for the selected electrostatic precipitator ash ESP 261. The heat treatment of this ESP ash, performed in air, consists of thermogravimetric
measurements for 150, 400, 650, 1000, and 1300 °C, and direct melting for 1350, 1400, and 1500 °C.
Table 1. Phases relationship experimental conditions for two representative fly ashes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Run</th>
<th>Raw material</th>
<th>Duration (hours)</th>
<th>Temperature (°C)</th>
<th>Phases present in the sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CEL2</td>
<td>ESP 261</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1350</td>
<td>Glass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL1</td>
<td>ESP 261</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1290</td>
<td>Glass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL8</td>
<td>ESP 261</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1272</td>
<td>Glass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL9</td>
<td>ESP 261</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1256</td>
<td>Glass + Spl&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL5</td>
<td>ESP 261</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>1240</td>
<td>Glass + Spl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL10</td>
<td>ESP 261</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1225</td>
<td>Glass + Spl + An&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL7</td>
<td>ESP 261</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>1190</td>
<td>Glass + Spl + An + Mel&lt;sup&gt;c&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL8</td>
<td>ESP 110</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1272</td>
<td>Glass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL9</td>
<td>ESP 110</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1256</td>
<td>Glass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEL11</td>
<td>ESP 110</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1202</td>
<td>Glass + Spl + An + Mel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup>Spl = spinel (Mg<sub>0.82</sub>Zn<sub>0.18</sub>)<sub>0</sub>(Al<sub>1.91</sub>Fe<sub>0.06</sub>Cr<sub>0.03</sub>)<sub>0</sub>4.  
<sup>b</sup>An = anorthite CaAl<sub>2</sub>Si<sub>2</sub>O<sub>8</sub>.  
<sup>c</sup>Mel = melilite Ca<sub>2</sub>Mg<sub>0.26</sub>Al<sub>1.38</sub>Si<sub>1.53</sub>O<sub>7</sub>.  


Table 2. Chemical composition of the selected electrostatic precipitator ash, ESP 261, of the products TGA of the glasses, DM 1h 1400 and DM 16h 1400, obtained after direct melting of ESP 261 at 1400 °C during 1 and 16 hours, respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ESP 261</th>
<th>TGA 150</th>
<th>TGA 400</th>
<th>TGA 650</th>
<th>TGA 1000</th>
<th>TGA 1300</th>
<th>DM 1h 1400</th>
<th>DM 16h 1400</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mass b (mg)</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>1958</td>
<td>1915</td>
<td>1830</td>
<td>1690</td>
<td>1643</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass loss c (%)</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>4.25</td>
<td>8.50</td>
<td>15.50</td>
<td>17.85</td>
<td>17.36</td>
<td>17.14</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Si (wt.%)</td>
<td>13.57</td>
<td>13.75</td>
<td>14.34</td>
<td>15.77</td>
<td>16.78</td>
<td>16.78</td>
<td>17.36</td>
<td>17.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al (wt.%)</td>
<td>8.85</td>
<td>8.98</td>
<td>9.40</td>
<td>10.47</td>
<td>11.20</td>
<td>11.32</td>
<td>12.22</td>
<td>12.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe (wt.%)</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>1.33</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>0.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mn (wt.%)</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mg (wt.%)</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td>2.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ca (wt.%)</td>
<td>15.94</td>
<td>16.14</td>
<td>16.52</td>
<td>18.07</td>
<td>18.88</td>
<td>19.95</td>
<td>20.48</td>
<td>20.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Na (wt.%)</td>
<td>2.40</td>
<td>2.46</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K (wt.%)</td>
<td>3.35</td>
<td>3.35</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>2.20</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti (wt.%)</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>1.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P (wt.%)</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOI d (wt.%)</td>
<td>16.93</td>
<td>15.85</td>
<td>13.51</td>
<td>7.38</td>
<td>2.38</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl (wt.%)</td>
<td>6.58</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>5.37</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S (wt.%)</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total C (wt.%)</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td>3.28</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOC e (wt.%)</td>
<td>2.63</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As (ppm)</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cd (ppm)</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co (ppm)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cr (ppm)</td>
<td>371</td>
<td>373</td>
<td>397</td>
<td>364</td>
<td>448</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cu (ppm)</td>
<td>792</td>
<td>790</td>
<td>800</td>
<td>854</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hg (ppm)</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ni (ppm)</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pb (ppm)</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>2246</td>
<td>2286</td>
<td>1503</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sb (ppm)</td>
<td>284</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>317</td>
<td>317</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sn (ppm)</td>
<td>787</td>
<td>802</td>
<td>805</td>
<td>835</td>
<td>830</td>
<td>889</td>
<td>708</td>
<td>915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zn (ppm)</td>
<td>5044</td>
<td>5101</td>
<td>5153</td>
<td>5620</td>
<td>4748</td>
<td>5224</td>
<td>1831</td>
<td>2483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*aTGA, thermogravimetric analysis. bThis mass corresponds to the initial mass for ESP and to the final mass obtained after each TGA. cMass loss = 100. (initial mass - final mass) / initial mass. dIn italic, the calculated mass loss (%) = 100 . [1 – (X_{Si,ESP ash} / X_{Si,Glass})]. eLOI = loss on ignition at 980 °C. fTOC = total organic carbon. g n.d. = not determined.
Fig. 1

- ESP ashes
- selected ESP ash
- SDSR
- < 1400 °C

SiO₂ / Al₂O₃ = 2.7
SiO₂ / Al₂O₃ = 1.5

- CaO
- Al₂O₃
- SiO₂

1723 °C
1544 °C
1170 °C
1365 °C
1495 °C
2020 °C
2570 °C

Lime
Tridymite
Mullite
Larnite
Pseudo wollastonite
Anorthite
Cristobalite
Gehlenite
Cristobalite
2CaO.Al₂O₃.SiO₂
3Al₂O₃.2SiO₂
3CaO.SiO₂
2CaO.Al₂O₃.SiO₂
2CaO.SiO₂
3CaO.SiO₂

< 1400 °C

2200 °C
2400 °C
1400 °C
1512 °C
1800 °C
1440 °C
1553 °C
1553 °C
1495 °C
1840 °C
1365 °C
1512 °C
1800 °C
1365 °C
1495 °C
1840 °C
1365 °C
1495 °C
1840 °C
Fig. 2

- Experimentally determined liquidus temperature

- $\text{SiO}_2 / \text{Al}_2\text{O}_3 = 1.5$
- $\text{SiO}_2 / \text{Al}_2\text{O}_3 = 2.7$
Fig. 3

Temperature (°C)

Mass (g)

Relative mass loss (%)

TGA 1300
TGA 1000
TGA 650

Liquidus
Fig. 4
Fig. 5a
Fig. 5b

![Graph showing the evaporation of different metals as a function of temperature. The graph includes lines for As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Ni, Pb, and Zn. Each line represents the evaporation percentage at different temperatures.](image-url)